Manage Migration for Development

- a study on coherence between the Policy for Global Development and the proposed Labour Immigration Policy

Master thesis in Africa and International Development Cooperation
Authors: Sofia Gustafsson and Emma Harrysson
Supervisor: Lennart Wohlgemuth
Spring 2007
"What matters are not the things a person has - or the feelings these provide - but what a person is, or can be, and does, or can do."

Amartya Sen
Abstract

The purpose of the study is to examine whether the Swedish migration policies regarding labour immigration, adhere to the aim of the Policy for Global Development (PGD) to create policy coherence for development. The points of departure for the thesis are that coherence within and between policies are of great importance for a global development that is both sustainable and equitable and that migration is important for development in a country.

In order to reach the result a text analysis of the final report written by the Committee on Labour Immigration has been made complemented with a semi-structured interview. The analysis has been done in the light of the PGD, and the main focus has been on the coherence between migration and development policies and if the proposal creates conditions for a win-win-win situation. The theoretical framework departs from the debate on the concept of coherence and migration for development.

The result of the analysis shows that the proposal put forward by the Committee on Labour Immigration is not coherent with the objectives of the PGD. It further indicates that the responsibility for the Policy of Global Development is not clear among all policy makers. The conclusion of the thesis therefore stresses the importance of thorough implementation and information about the PGD if the rhetoric shall be followed by action. It further stresses the need for more research on the effects of migration on the most vulnerable countries of origin in order to create coherent policies which makes migration a positive force for all stakeholders.

Keywords
Coherence, Brain circulation, Migration, Policy for Global Development (PGU), KAKI
Acknowledgements

We would like to thank everyone who has helped us to accomplish this project, especially Eva Tobisson and Alexander Peyre Dutreyl who gave us inspiration in the early stage of the process and who shared their time and knowledge with us. We would also like to thank Sara Erlandsson for her input and our tutor Lennart Wohlgemuth. Finally we would like to thank our families who has put up with us during this time.
Abbreviations

ACBF African Capacity Building Foundation
AU African Union
DAC Development Assistance Committee
EEA European Economic Area, (the EU25 and Iceland, Norway and Lichtenstein
EU European Union
EU15 The 15 member states of the EU until 30 April 2004
EU25 The 25 member states of the EU from 1 May 2004
GCIM Global Commission on International Migration
IMF International Organisation for Migration
IOM International Organisation of Migration
ODA Official Development Aid
OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
PGD Policy for Global Development, Swedish Government bill 2002/03:122
SOU Statens Offentliga Utredningar (Parliamentary Report)
SSA Sub Saharan Africa
UNHCR United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

List of figures

Figure 1, page 27: Challenges of labour migration.
Figure 2, page 33: Some facts on African Migration.
Figure 3, page 35: Current Permits.
Figure 4, page 36: Summary of the proposed new kinds of permit.

List of appendix

Appendix 1: Instruments for the analysis.
Appendix 2: Interview guide
Appendix 3: UN chart; “Balance sheet” of economic effects of migration on countries of origin.
Table of contents

1 Introduction and Problem definition ................................................................. 6
   1.1 Purpose and Questions of Interests .............................................................. 7
   1.2 Definitions ................................................................................................. 7
   1.3 Outline of thesis ....................................................................................... 9
2 Methodology and Material .............................................................................. 10
   2.1 Methodological approach ......................................................................... 10
   2.2 Method for text analysis .......................................................................... 10
   2.3 Interviews and e-mail correspondence ...................................................... 11
   2.4 Choice of theoretical framework .............................................................. 12
   2.5 The process and delimitations .................................................................. 12
   2.6 Material .................................................................................................... 13
3 Theoretical framework .................................................................................. 14
   3.1 The concept of coherence ......................................................................... 14
   3.2 Coherence and development cooperation ................................................. 18
   3.3 Migration – a source for development ...................................................... 20
   3.4 Theories on migration and development ................................................... 24
4 Migration from an African perspective ......................................................... 30
5 Presentation of material ................................................................................ 33
   5.1 The Committee on Labour Immigration’s final report ................................ 33
   5.2 Shared Responsibility – Sweden’s Policy for Global Development .......... 38
6 Swedish migration policies in perspective ..................................................... 40
7 Results .......................................................................................................... 41
   7.1 Policy Coherence ..................................................................................... 41
   7.2 Conditions for win-win-win, created or not? ............................................ 45
8 Conclusions .................................................................................................. 53
9 List of references ......................................................................................... 56
Appendix ........................................................................................................ 59
   Appendix 1: Instrument guide for the analysis .............................................. 59
   Appendix 2: Interview guide ......................................................................... 60
   Appendix 3: UN chart; “Balance sheet” of economic effects of migration on countries of origin ................................................................. 61
1 Introduction and Problem definition

In the era of globalisation the need of manpower has increased. Economic growth and development is considered to depend on migration. According to the Global Commission on International Migration (GCIM) certain sectors of the economy in both developing countries and industrialized states would collapse without the presence of migrant labour.\(^1\)

The demand for labour is certainly true to many states of the North. This can be a result of industrial improvements but also lack of working labour due to an older population and a labour-intensive service sector.\(^2\) In contrast to this, many countries of the South have a young population\(^3\) and huge problems of unemployment. Many of these countries are at the same time loosing large numbers of skilled persons to other countries, leading to a lack of capacity and human resources in their country of origin, the so called brain drain. This is the situation for many countries of Africa. Fantu Cheru, among others, states that brain drain is a threat to African development, claiming that “reversing this trend is a precondition for a well-functioning society”.\(^4\)

There is no consensus of the real impact of migration on the countries of origin however. The debate has included the questions of brain circulation lately and how to achieve positive effects for both the destination and the country of origin. Questions that arise are if it is possible for Sub Saharan Africa to gain from global migration? If so, what conditions must be fulfilled for this to happen? Is brain circulation a utopian myth fed by those who want to justify the brain drain or is it a real possibility which creates a win-win-win situation and thereby confirms the idea that migration contributes positively to development?

The global community calls for greater coherence to more effectively govern the issue of migration for development. Sweden adopted a Policy for Global Development in 2003 in order to achieve policy coherence between policy areas to reach equitable and

\(^1\) GCIM 2005, summary: p.3
\(^2\) Sida studies no.9 2003: p.6
\(^3\) Ibid.
\(^4\) Cheru 2002: p.12
sustainable development. The intention is that all policy areas should be permeated by the objectives of the PGD, five areas are prioritised, migration being one of them.

Labour migration has become an issue discussed more frequently in Sweden as future prognoses indicate that a need in manpower will be a reality in the near future. In February 2004 the Swedish government assigned a parliamentary Committee to propose new regulations for labour migration from countries outside the European Economic Area (EEA) and Switzerland. In the instructions they were asked to consider the PGD and the effects on the countries of origin. Their report “Arbetskraftsinvandring till Sverige – förslag och konsekvenser” (SOU 2006:87) was presented to the Government in October 2006 and will be circulated for consideration in the near future.

1.1 Purpose and Questions of Interests

The purpose of this study is to examine whether the Swedish migration policies concerning labour immigration, adhere to the aim of the government Bill 2002/03:122 to create Policy Coherence for Development in order to contribute to an equitable and sustainable development, bearing in mind the two perspectives of the bill; the rights perspective and the perspective of the poor.

1.1.1 Questions of interest:

1) Does the Committee on Labour Immigration take the objectives of the Government Bill 2002/03:122 into consideration in their proposal of a new policy for labour immigration to Sweden?
2) Does the proposal for a new labour immigration policy create conditions for brain circulation and a win-win-win situation that contributes to sustainable and equitable development in the country of origin?

1.2 Definitions

Some important concepts in this thesis will be accounted for below; further concepts will be explained in the text as well as more extensive definitions.
Coherence: Policy coherence involves systematic promotion of mutually reinforcing policy actions across government departments and agencies creating synergies towards achieving the defined objectives. The objectives should, at the same time, not be undermined or frustrated by actions or activities of government in that field or in other policy fields.\(^5\)

Brain circulation: The general meaning of the concept is that brain circulation arises when migrants return to the country of origin with new skills. This thesis side with the definition of Tanner which states that brain circulation arises when migrants return to the country of origin, unless there is already a significant, ultimate economic net loss for the country of origin due to emigration.\(^6\)

The Committee on Labour Immigration (KAKI): In February 2004 the Swedish government gave a parliamentary Committee the assignment to propose new regulations for labour migration from countries outside the EEA and Switzerland. In response to this the Committee presented their final report “Arbetskraftsinvandring till Sverige – förslag och konsekvenser” in October 2006. The Committee on Labour Immigration will be referred to as the Committee in the text, and their final report as the report.

Third country national: The term is used in the Swedish Aliens Act and is defined in the 1 chapter 3c § as a foreigner who is not a citizen in an EU country, EEA country or Switzerland.

Vulnerable country: In this thesis the term is used for countries with lack of skilled capacity.

Win-win-win: A situation when migration benefits the developing country of origin, the destination country and the individual.

---

\(^5\) Hoebink 1999: p.324, Odén and Lundquist 2007: p.4  
\(^6\) Tanner 2005: p.17-18
1.3 Outline of thesis

The methodology used in the thesis is mainly qualitative text analysis discussed and described in the following chapter. The process and delimitations will also be accounted for.

The purpose of the study and the questions of interest outlined above are drawn from the theoretical framework which is presented in part three. This includes a presentation of the concept of coherence and the current debate on migration for development in order to introduce the reader to the complexity of the two issues that are in focus. The theoretical point of departure of this thesis is also presented which is rooted in the importance of coherence for development as the prerequisite, if brain circulation is to lead to a win-win-win situation.

In order to give the debate an African perspective, a short presentation of African migration will follow in chapter four. Remittances and brain circulation in an African context are discussed. A presentation of the views of the AU is also given.

In part five the reader will be introduced to the report analysed. Their point of departure will be presented as well as a summary of the proposal for a new labour immigration policy. As the analysis is made in the light of the Swedish policy for global development a brief summary of the bill is conducted.

This is followed by a short presentation of Swedish Migration Policies in perspective.

The findings from the analysis will be presented and discussed in part seven in two sections according to the questions of interest for the research followed by a brief summary of the results. In the conclusion the purpose of the thesis will be discussed as well as the result and suggestions for further research.
2 Methodology and Material

In this chapter the methodology used will be accounted for. The process will be described as well as the delimitations made. The chapter will end with a paragraph on the material analysed.

2.1 Methodological approach

The main methodological approach in this thesis will be qualitative analyses, as Bjereld, Demker and Hinnfors puts it, are all methods that are not quantitative qualitative, meaning it to be a generic term. Quantitative methods are characterized by quantification and standardisation of the material to find patterns and relations between categories and phenomenon’s. They are more formalised and structured than qualitative methods which are more flexible. As qualitative methods are useful when the primer purpose is to find a deeper understanding of a problem it is the most useful methodological approach in this thesis.

Text analysis is chosen as the main methodology. This is the most relevant method since the purpose is to analyse the coherence between policies, which are a governmental report on labour immigration and the PGD. One semi-structured interview has been carried out and some e-mail correspondence with key informants made in order to test the reliability of information.

2.2 Method for text analysis

In order to analyse the main material, a critical analysis approach was chosen. Esaiasson et al divide the critical analysis into three different approaches referring to the study of ideas, ideology and discourse. Critical analysis of ideas considers to what extent a given argumentation follows certain norms. In the analysis in this thesis, it means considering the claims of the government and how far they seem to apply or their relevance in a given situation, as put by the Sussex Language Institute.

---

7 Bjereld, Demker and Hinnfors 2002: p.114
8 Ibid.
9 Holme and Solvang 1991: p.13, 100
10 Esaiasson et al 2004: p.234-237
11 Sussex language institute
Departing from the purpose and questions of interest further sub-questions has been formulated from which to analyse the material,\(^{12}\) in order to reach a result. These questions are the foundation for the analysis and they have been formulated directly from the theoretical framework, to ensure the validity of the study. These questions have been complemented with an analysis based on relevance, consistency and sustainability.\(^{13}\) The results have been structured from the questions of interest and an open attitude to the material and the possible outcome has been held, focusing on the purpose of the thesis.\(^{14}\) Esaiasson et al emphasize the importance to make delimitations and definitions when using an open attitude.\(^{15}\) The theories have been contextualised with a survey of the current debate on the issues making selections according to the purpose of the thesis, leaving a lot of interesting questions out.

### 2.3 Interviews and e-mail correspondence

An interview with two persons from the department for Development Policy at the Ministry of Foreign Affairs has been carried out, namely: Eva Tobisson, senior adviser, and Alexander Peyre Dutrey, trainee. The interview was semi-structured and followed prepared questions\(^{16}\) but was flexible to let the persons interviewed develop their ideas.\(^{17}\) The documentation of the interview has been done with help of written notes.

E-mail correspondence with Gustaf Rönneklev at the Department for Migration and Asylum Policy at the Ministry of Justice has taken place in order to confirm some information provided in media. Rönneklev was the secretary for the Committee on Labour Immigration.

The interview, and the e-mail contacts, has been with so called key-informants, persons with special information and knowledge about migration and development, the Bill 2002/03:122 and the work of the Committee of Labour Immigration. This is a complementary source of information to the text analysis more than a main source for analysis.

\(^{12}\) Appendix 1
\(^{13}\) Esaiasson et al 2004: p.239
\(^{14}\) Esaiasson et al 2004: p.240-242
\(^{15}\) Ibid.
\(^{16}\) Appendix 2
\(^{17}\) Denscombe 2000: p.135
2.4 Choice of theoretical framework

To get a better understanding of the importance of coherence and the linkage between migration and development secondary sources have been used. In order to choose strategic material a broad understanding has been searched for. The sources have been tested to see if they reinforce or conflict with each other. Theories that would provide instruments for the analysis have thereafter been chosen. In the final choice the reliability has been important as well as a wish that the theory should bring matters to a head.18

2.5 The process and delimitations

The point of departure for this thesis is that coherence within and between policies are of great importance for a global development that is both sustainable and equitable. Brain drain or brain circulation, migration and development, need of labour due to demographic changes are all burning issues that are debated globally today. The focus on migration and the possibility of it as a means to development is therefore natural. In order to make the research feasible, limitations were needed. The concept of coherence or the issue of migration and development by themselves could easily make the basis for two separate papers. The linkage between those areas is interesting though, as well as if the PGD as stated in the Bill 2002/03:122 have been implemented in other policy areas apart from developmental aid.

In 2004 the Swedish government ordered an investigation on possible effects of a new labour immigration policy. A Parliamentary Committee was put together and instructed to carry out the investigation and to put forward a proposal for a new labour immigration policy. As this Committee was given their instructions after the PGD an analysis of their final report will give an understanding of the implementation of the PGD and of the conflicting interests that might limit the coherence. General conclusions relating to all policy areas can not be made however, by analysing one report only. It should be seen as an example and further research would be necessary to test the result on other reports or proposals that have been put forward after the Bill 2002/03:122.

18 Esaiasson et al 2004: p.244
The PGD covers many aspects of the Swedish policies. Migration, being one of them, is closely linked to several other policy areas such as trade, agriculture, environment, peace and security, and human rights. The need for coherence is therefore great. This study will not cover these links however. It will be limited to the final report of the Committee of Labour Immigration and will concentrate on the statements in the Bill 2002/03:122 which relate to labour migration bearing the two perspectives in mind.

In the debate on migration for development impacts of remittances and the Diasporas are often mentioned. The focus of this thesis will however be labour migration and the mobility of human capacity. The topic on remittances will be touched upon as this is mentioned and highlighted as a positive effect of migration, in the final report of the Committee on Labour Immigration. As the Diasporas do not play a significant role in the report of the Committee their impact will not be discussed.

Coherence at national level is important in order to reach global coherence. As stated by GCIM nations are the owners of international organisations. Coherence begins at home and “incoherence at the national level has tended to cascade upwards and to affect the work of these multilateral institutions.” This thesis will therefore deal with coherence within the Swedish policies only and even if EU affects the Swedish policies in many ways the focus of this thesis is the proposal for a new immigration policy for Sweden.

A thesis on this level is not able to give justice to neither the complexity of migration for development nor the complexity of coherence. The intention of examining the coherence within the Swedish policies through one report is to prove the importance of thorough implementation and to outline some of the complexity within policy making and the area of migration for development.

2.6 Material

The main focus of the research is the Government Bill 2002/03:122 and the final report by the Committee of Labour Immigration, including appendix. These are both primary sources. They have been complemented with an unprinted Memorandum from the

19 GCIM 2005: p.67
Ministry of Foreign Affairs, which concerns the Report from a PGD perspective\textsuperscript{20}, as well as the interview.

3 Theoretical framework

The theoretical framework for this thesis departs from the debates on coherence and migration for development and will be presented in separate sections in this chapter. Each section starts with an overview of the debate and ends with a theoretical discussion.

3.1 The concept of coherence

OECD and DAC had been calling for policy coordination for years when they in 1991 launched the concept of coherence, by turning the focus from the means for development cooperation to its ends.\textsuperscript{21} At that time the volume of aid was decreasing and “to avoid policies at cross-purposes, policy coherence was considered conducive to a more efficient use of public funds”.\textsuperscript{22} Another factor, affecting the demand for coherence, was the recognition of the impacts globalisation has on the countries of the South. The perspective from the beginning was therefore explicitly to promote development in the South.\textsuperscript{23} This is important to bear in mind when studying the coherence of various policies towards the South. Especially, as the urge for coherence can be used for domestic interests and turn the focus away from the poorest countries and their development needs.\textsuperscript{24}

Since the adoption of the Maastricht treaty in 1992 the concept of coherence has become important in the debate, but even if the concept within social and political science is rather new the ideas behind it have been a part of the international development cooperation in the past.\textsuperscript{25} There is, however, no common definition of the concept yet, probably because it is a new part of the study of policies,\textsuperscript{26} which is

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{enumerate}
\item Peyre Dutrey 2006
\item Forster and Stokke 1999: p.46-47
\item Forster and Stokke 1999: p.47
\item Forster and Stokke 1999: p.48
\item Forster and Stokke 1999: p.34
\item Forster and Stokke 1999: p.2, Molina undated: p.235
\item Forster and Stokke 1999: p.19
\end{enumerate}
\end{footnotesize}
important to bear in mind reading different evaluation reports concerning policy coherence.

The Maastricht treaty created a legal basis for the EU policy on development cooperation with the guiding principles of coherence, coordination and complementarity, known as the three Cs. The Swedish government followed the example and created the legislative framework for policy coherence through the Swedish Government Bill 2002/03:122, Shared Responsibility: Sweden’s Policy for Global Development (PGD). In the Bill the government presents a policy for development, with the goal to contribute to an equitable and sustainable development. In order to achieve this all components of Swedish policies must be consistent with one another and greater coherence must be reached.

3.1.1 The importance of coherence

According to Mkandawire, cited by Molina, “The main rationale for seeking coherence is the observed existence of policy incoherence.” Incoherence might lead to that intended results are frustrated by policies within a particular field or another more or less related field; this in turn might lead to that the government authorities lose their legitimacy and credibility.

The main reason for coherence, except for the observed incoherence, is basically effectiveness and quality:

- “Effectiveness, because promoting coherence is a way of improving the impact of the limited funds available for development aid.
- Quality, because coherence allows the detection of interference and incompatibility, and of course complementary aspects among the various components of policy upon implementation.”

Even though coherence has high priority by many governments, it has been analysed and implemented only to a limited extent according to Molina, at the Institut Universitari d’Estudis Europeus. This seems to be slowly changing however. One

27 Triple C Evaluations no 2 2006: p.14
28 Molina undated: p.243
29 Hoebink 1999: p.325
30 Triple C Evaluations no 2 2006: p.14
reason for the limited number of analysis made so far might be that it is difficult to find out if policies reinforce each other; another that it is difficult to reach policy coherence. In a democratic political system policy making is a result of “consensus and middle way solutions” between many interest groups and therefore involves a certain degree of incoherence. According to Hoebink, associate professor at the University of Nijmegen, there is, however, a diversification between intended and unintended incoherence. The intended incoherence refers to when the authorities “consciously accepts that the objectives of policy in a particular field cannot be achieved because the policy involves conflicting interests.” Unintended incoherence is caused by lack of information, incorrect information or because different areas of policies never are compared. This might lead to that policy in one field challenges the objectives and results of policies within another field. Policy coherence therefore demands a clear commitment by the government according to Forster and Stokke as it cannot be taken for granted.

Coherence at the national level is very important as that is where most decisions are being made. GCIM emphasize that “coherence begins at home” as national states are the owners of international organisations and hold the key to coherence at all levels, national, regional and international. GCIM further notes that incoherence at national level tends to cascade upwards and affect the work of the multilateral institutions as well.

3.1.2 Definition of coherence

The concept of coherence within politics and political science is rather new and there is still no common definition of the concept. To suit the purpose of the study a broad definition of the concept of policy coherence has been adapted. A narrow definition would be as described by Hoebink “that objectives of policy in a particular field may not be undermined or obstructed by actions or activities in this field” and a broad

31 Molina undated: p.243
32 Hoebink 1999: p.335
34 Forster and Stokke 1999: p.52
35 GCIM 2005: p.67
36 Forster and Stokke 1999: p.43
37 GCIM 2005: p.47
38 Forster and Stokke 1999: p.19
definition would be “that objectives of policy in a particular field may not be undermined or obstructed by actions or activities of government in that field or in other policy fields.” Forster and Stokke have added further dimensions to the concept involving motives, strategies and the actual impact of policies. In this way policy coherence becomes a measure of institutional effectiveness. Forster and Stokkes definition as understood by Molina is referred to as it gives a clearer understanding of the concept;

“Policy coherence is a policy whose objectives, strategies and mechanisms are attuned; these objectives should reinforce each other, or as a minimum, not conflict between them. Objectives should be strengthened by the intentions or motives on which they are based; the policy outcome should correspond to the intentions and objectives, and reinforce the other policies pursued within the policy framework of the system, or at least not having a negative impact on them. New policy initiatives should promote, or at least not conflict with, past political initiatives.”

DAC gives a more comprehensible definition but leaving out the dimension of minimizing conflicts, saying that;

"Policy coherence…involves the systematic promotion of mutually reinforcing policy actions across government departments and agencies creating synergies towards achieving the defined objectives.”

The concept is not explicitly defined in the Swedish Policy for Global Development but the aim of the policy is to create synergies and to minimize conflicting policies. A definition serving the purpose of this study should therefore involve both these dimensions. Apart from Forster and Stokke and Molinas rather complicated definition this has not been found. A combination of the definition of DAC and of Hoebink could fill this function however;

Policy coherence involves systematic promotion of mutually reinforcing policy actions across government departments and agencies creating synergies towards achieving the defined objectives. The objectives should, at the same time, not be

---

39 Hoebink 1999: p.324
40 Molina undated: p.244-245
41 Odén and Lundquist 2007: p.4
undermined or frustrated by actions or activities of government in that field or in other policy fields.

3.2 Coherence and development cooperation

In searching for a theoretical framework regarding coherence, it was found that Forster and Stokke are often referred to. They have written a lot of articles on the subject as well as being editors for the book: Policy Coherence in Development Co-operation (1999). Their approach to the challenges of policy coherence provides instruments that enable a study of the policy coherence of the Swedish policies. Forster and Stokke share Mkandawire’s point of departure and argue for a rational choice approach when creating policies in order to gain greater coherence. To be able to reach the overall objectives of development cooperation, policy objectives should be clear and harmonised. The objectives within development cooperation should be internally consistent and objectives within other areas, such as migration, should be harmonised with them or at least not conflicting. Further, strategies and mechanisms should be attuned to the objectives and as a minimum not conflict with the intentions and motives. Lastly, the outcome and impacts should correspond with the intentions of the objectives or at least not conflict.42

In order to make the concept operative Forster and Stokke outlines a number of parameters;43

1) The objective of policy coherence – for what and for whom?
2) “Coherence between the various stages of policy formulation and implementation…between motives and objectives and actual outcomes and impacts.”44 Questions to ask according to Molina would be; is there a logical sequence of the decisions taken? And is the relation between the objectives, the instruments and the outcomes of a certain policy adequate?45
3) At which levels are coherence to be achieved?46 Hydén, in Forster and Stokke, argues that a certain measure of policy incoherence at one level may be

42 Forster and Stokke 1999: p.2, 20
43 Forster and Stokke 1999: p.20
44 Ibid.
45 Molina, undated: p.244
46 Forster and Stokke 1999: p.20
necessary to be able to reach policy coherence at a more important level.\textsuperscript{47} This relates to the first parameter and for whom coherence is sought and in order to answer a clear priority must be made between different policy areas and objectives. This is probably a source of conflict between departments and interest groups.

In the analyses of the interim report made by The Committee on Labour Immigration the focus will be on the first two parameters as they apply to the aim of the study.

Policy coherence is conceived within a defined administrative system. Forster and Stokke identify four systematic frameworks of policy coherence applied to relations with developing countries; two relate to policies within a donor country, where one deals with aid policies and the second with all policies; the last two relate to policies within various international systems.

1. Coherence of the development cooperation policy within a donor government.
2. Coherence of the various policies within a country towards the South.
3. Coherence of donors’ policies towards the South, aid policies in particular but also all policies effecting the relations towards the South.
4. Donor-recipient coherence, with particular reference to development policies.\textsuperscript{48}

Since the study is on the policy coherence within Sweden’s national system and policies referring to two areas, development and migration, the main interest is on the framework which relates to this. This one will therefore be explained further.

3.2.1 \textbf{Coherence of the various policies within a country towards the South}

There are many relations between a donor and a recipient country apart from aid; several of these affect the impact of development aid. It is therefore important that all relations are seen in their context and that the policies cohere with each other and to the least not counteract the aims of the development cooperation. If this is not the case other

\textsuperscript{47} Forster and Stokke 1999: p.4
\textsuperscript{48} Forster and Stokke 1999: p.2-3, 22-23
relations can frustrate the development aid, which neither promotes sustainable development nor is cost efficient. It is also important to recognize that national decisions outside the realm of development cooperation, do not only have national consequences, but also affect other countries’ development opportunities. If these policies counteract objectives pursued through aid they are by definition incoherent according to Forster and Stokke. Policymaking in all areas must therefore be seen in a global context. It is also important to recognise that what seems to be coherent from one perspective may be incoherent from another. Forster and Stokke therefore emphasize that the perspective matters. From what perspective is the coherence being analysed? 49 Within the national system there are many stakeholders and their perspectives differ and for most ministries the perspectives are linked to domestic interests. The rationale of separate units may conflict with the logic of the national system in the area studied. To further complicate the situation a single country is not isolated from the global politics. International organisations have a strong influence especially on the development discourse, brought into the negotiations between different stakeholders on the national level and the outcome may be that the objectives on the national level conflict or harmonise with international agreements. 50

3.2.2 Point of departure for the thesis

With the discussion above as background the point of departure for the thesis is that: Policy coherence from the perspective of the PGD means that coherence within and between policy areas are needed, in order to obtain an equitable and sustainable development. Synergies should be strived for and to the least should actions and activities within other policies not frustrate the objectives outlined in the PGD.

3.3 Migration – a source for development

When formulating policies on migration, coherence needs to be taken into consideration. GCIM puts forward that “Today’s challenge is to formulate policies that maximize the positive impact of migration on countries of origin while limiting its negative consequences.” 51

---

49 Forster and Stokke 1999: p.22
50 Forster and Stokke 1999: p.30-31
51 GCIM 2005: p.23
Within the debate on development, focus on migration has increased during the last years. The interest on the global level has resulted in the UN High-level Dialogue on International Migration and Development in September 2006 and a report concluded by the Global Commission on International Migration (GCIM) in October 2005. At the regional level documents like the AU’s “African Common Position on Migration and Development” (June 2006) and the Communication on Migration and development published by the EU Commission (October 2005) focus on the connection between migration and development. At the national level the Bill 2002/03:122 “Shared Responsibility – Sweden’s Policy for Global Development” stresses the importance of migration for development. It defines migration as one of its five prioritised areas stating that “One important challenge will be to find new arrangements for organized migration so that people’s desire to pursue a better life in a new country can become a positive force for global development to a greater extent than at present.”

That migration could be a positive force for development in both countries of origin and countries of destination, if supported by the right set of policies, was agreed upon at the UN High-level Dialogue on International migration and Development. According to Global Commission on International Migration (GCIM), migration and development are linked in a number of ways. First, lack of development resulting in unemployment and absence of sustainable livelihoods is one of the most important reasons for international migration. Second, development in the destination countries is contributed by migrants as they fill gaps in the labour market and “by providing essential skills and by bringing social, cultural and intellectual dynamism to the societies that migrants have joined.” The third linkage is the connection between migration and development, poverty reduction and growth in the country of origin through “economic, political, social and cultural contribution to the societies they have left behind.” This contribution could be in form of remittances, decreased unemployment, investments, new ideas and understanding between countries of origin and destination, new skills, experience and contacts.

53 UN General Assembly A/61/515 2006: p.2
54 GCIM 2005: p.23
55 Ibid.
56 Ibid.
### 3.3.1 Labour migration

At the UN High-level Dialogue on International migration and Development, it was emphasised that “labour migration was crucial for the world economy”.Labour migration is a rural-urban, South-South as well as a South-North phenomenon. The gap between the rich and the poor regions continues to grow. Jan O. Karlsson, Co-chair person of the GCIM writes in his article “A new global direction for policies on migration and development” that high income countries have per capita GDPS 66 times as large as those of low-income countries concluding that this is the reason behind the fact that rich countries accommodate 60 per cent of the world’s migrants. When poorer regions are located close to richer areas like at the Mediterranean, pull factors become very strong.

Demographic differences are another source for migration from poor to rich regions. While developed countries decrease in terms of workforce, developing countries increase in share of people in working age. To fill the gap in workforce due to a shrinking and older population in the developed world, recruitment of migrant labour will be needed to sustain the level of economic growth and to maintain existing pensions and social security systems. Shortage of workforce due to an ageing population will require a need for both low-skilled and highly skilled labour migrants.

The number of migrants has increased rapidly over the years. In 1970 there were 82 million migrants compared to about 200 million today, which counts for three per cent of the world population. This means that 97 per cent of the population in the world live in their country of birth. The reasons for this could be “interpersonal, national, ethnic and religious affection, despondence or unwillingness to lose insider-advantages in the potential emigration regions”. Another reason is the policy of restrictive immigration regulations.

---

57 UN General Assembly A/61/515 2006: p.4  
58 Karlsson 2006: p.36  
59 Tamas and Palme 2006: p.16  
60 Tamas 2006: p.5  
62 Tamas 2006: p.9  
63 Karlsson 2006: p.35  
64 Tamas 2006: p.9
An increased number of countries have opened up for labour immigration.\textsuperscript{65} This situation might lead to increased global competition for labour migrants as well as an increased migration pressure. Acting responsible globally in finding legal systems for labour migration is needed to avoid a drain of human capital from poor countries.\textsuperscript{66} In Sweden a report has been prepared by The Committee on Labour Immigration with the aim to propose a regulatory framework that will allow more extensive labour immigration from countries outside the EU/EEA and Switzerland.

### 3.3.2 Brain circulation

Many developing countries lack the capacity to take advantage of the linkage between migration and development. A negative aspect for development is the emigration of high skilled workforce, so called brain drain, which in Sub Sahara Africa has resulted in a serious loss for states that have put efforts in investing in education.\textsuperscript{67}

Government Communication 2005/06:204 states that migration not necessarily leads to loss of skills, stating that the global trend is that temporary and circular migration is on the increase. “Research shows that the repatriation of migrants has a very positive effect on human capital in the country of origin.”\textsuperscript{68} A program in that direction is temporary labour migration which is by GCIM suggested to be positive for development.\textsuperscript{69} Tamas and Palme, at the Institute for Futures Studies in Stockholm, put a warning of the use of the term brain circulation, “there is a need to be cautious about the wishful thinking among policymakers that often lies behind support for such notions. As developed countries want to recruit highly skilled migrants at low cost from poorer countries, it is to some extent convenient to portray such migration as beneficial to both parties.”\textsuperscript{70}

Both Sweden and countries of origin could benefit from better coherence and closer coordination between development policy and migration policy. Improvement of economic conditions in emigration countries through more efficient remittances, ensuring the rights of migrants, avoiding brain drain and develop structures of legal,

\textsuperscript{65} Tamas 2006: p.9
\textsuperscript{66} Tamas 2006: p.5
\textsuperscript{67} GCIM 2005: p.24
\textsuperscript{68} Comm. 2005/06:204: p.23
\textsuperscript{69} Karlsson 2006: p.38
\textsuperscript{70} Tamas and Palme 2006: p.20
circular labour migration are interests shared by both policy areas. Tamas states that “When migration is an integrated and coherent part of development policies, it should contribute to development and maximum benefits to both emigration and immigration countries. Then, globalisation can empower many more.” The Swedish Policy on Global Development is a policy document in that direction.

### 3.4 Theories on migration and development

The benefits and the negative effects of migration are known among both researchers and policymakers but knowledge is still lacking. The importance of research on migration and development is vital for progress on policymaking within the area. This view is chaired among researchers in the area of migration and development as well as among policymakers and practitioners.

The impacts of migration on development in developing countries are addressed by three different schools of thought. Two schools, the convergence school and the divergence school, are mainly based on economic theory. According to those two schools migration is caused by income differences between less developed and more developed countries. As a result of continued migration income differences are supposed to either decrease, and lead to convergence or increase and create more divergence. The third school, called the complexity school, brings together scholars from different disciplines and finds the link between migration and development as “much more ambivalent, unresolved and complex”. The school which has been more common in the 1990s and 2000s takes both positive effects like remittances and negative effects as brain drain into account.

When building the theoretical framework on labour migration and development Dr Arno Tanner, a Finnish Academy researcher, who represents the complexity school, has been chosen as the main theorist. Tanner has been chosen for his holistic overview on the effects of labour migration on sending and receiving countries, as well as his special

---

71 Tamas 2006: p.3
72 Tamas 2006: p.10
73 Tamas and Palme 2006: p.11
74 Tamas and Palme 2006: p.15
75 Tamas 2006: p.14
76 Ibid.
77 Ibid.
interest on migration of skilled elites and its effects on countries in Sub Sahara Africa. Tanner presents the research on voluntary emigration of skilled manpower, who intends to work in another country for one year or longer\textsuperscript{78} in the book “Emigration, Brain Drain and Development – The Case of Sub-Saharan Africa”. Emigration of that kind is described by Dr Tanner in various terms, defined as follows:

- **Brain outflow** – voluntary migration which “does not cause permanent losses for the country of origin, (either presently or in the future)”.  \textsuperscript{79}
- **Brain drain** – “an excessive, loss making emigration from a developing country to an essentially more developed one; Without return, there are no other benefits such as money remittances, or, in case of return happening, there are no compensating benefits comparable to the costs of education invested in the migrants as well as the loss of their foregone expertise and societal contributions”. \textsuperscript{80} “If there is some significant net compensation…comparable to that of the lost talent and its consequences, then the term can no longer be used”. \textsuperscript{81} In that case the author uses the term brain outflow.
- **Brain circulation** – “arises when brain outflow migrants return to the country of origin, unless there is already a significant, ultimate economic net loss for the country of origin due to emigration.”\textsuperscript{82}

### 3.4.1 A win-win-win situation

Migration of skilled elites could be of benefit for the developing country of origin, for the receiving country and for the individual. Such a “win-win-win” situation is obvious in many instances.\textsuperscript{83} The benefits for the different stakeholders are “extensively agreed upon, or at least hardly controversial.”\textsuperscript{84}

\textsuperscript{78} Tanner 2005: p.17
\textsuperscript{79} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{80} Tanner 2005: p.19-20
\textsuperscript{81} Tanner 2005: p.20
\textsuperscript{82} Tanner 2005: p.17-18
\textsuperscript{83} Tanner 2005: p.17-18
\textsuperscript{84} Tanner 2005: p.23
Benefits for country of origin

“Benefits for country of origin: 85

- Overpopulation relief
- Poverty relief
- Benefits from return
- Macro effects of remittances
- Benefits from Diasporas, social ”remittances” and philanthropy”

The country of origin might benefit from labour migration as overpopulation decreases as well as unemployment among highly skilled.86 Referring to the World Bank Tamas puts forward that increased salaries for remaining people or better employment opportunities might lead to poverty reduction.87 Poverty alleviation could also be a result from remittances.88 Poor families use migration as an “alternative livelihood strategy” when they send out family members to work and remit to the family staying behind.89 Remittances could as well benefit the country of origin through “hometown associations”. Those associations support development projects collectively.90 In the case of temporary immigration, return to the country of origin is an often reached result. When it comes to permanent immigration, a return to the country of origin could be a reality especially if the country of origin manages to provide better possibilities for career opportunities than when the emigrant left the country.91 The benefits from Diasporas, social remittances and philanthropy will not be discussed as these are not part of this study’s focus.

Benefits for country of destination

“Benefits for country of destination: 92

- Benefits from such labour that is currently needed
- Demographic needs
- Ageing population”

85 Ibid.
86 Tanner 2005: p.26
87 Tamas 2006: p.16
88 Lucas 2005: p.11
89 Tamas 2006: p.16
90 Tanner 2005: p.27-28
91 Ibid.
92 Tanner 2005: p.24
By filling human resource gaps with well-selected labour immigration, a country could reach positive economic development. To succeed with labour immigration, the destination country has to take into consideration the needs of finding individuals that are not only “capable, employable, and conversant in an appropriate language, but who are also able to continuously succeed in the host country labour market and in the long run, able to sufficiently integrate into the host society’s life”.

**Individual success**

The benefits for individuals would in a win-win-win situation be a better well-being for the individual and her/his family thanks to better career and educational possibilities, higher salaries and business related opportunities in the country of origin.

**3.4.2 Win-Win-Win difficult to meet**

Tanner states that there is increasing evidence showing that a “win-win-win“ situation seldom appears, more often emigration of skilled workforce turn to a loss, especially for more vulnerable countries of origin. The country of destination could also face problems due to international labour migration. As the thesis focuses on the effects on countries of origin, caused by labour migration, the key challenges for countries of destination will not be discussed in detail. See figure 1.

**Figure 1 Challenges of labour migration**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key Challenges for Country of origin</th>
<th>Key challenges for Country of destination</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Brain drain = infrastructure cannot stand the emigration</td>
<td>- Illegal immigration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The brightest do not return or re-emigrate</td>
<td>- Labour immigration does not match needs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- The remittances may diminish over time</td>
<td>- Labour immigration does not integrate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Remittances “dead money”, only benefit the elites, increasing income differences</td>
<td>- Labour immigration causes unemployment and social problems</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Remittances make the country sluggish and too dependent</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

93 Tanner 2005: p.29  
94 Tanner 2005: p.25  
95 Tanner 2005: p.32  
96 Tanner 2005: p.33
3.4.3 Brain drain more likely than brain circulation

Referring to researchers as Lowell, Faini, De La Garza, Constant and Massey, Tanner states that the more integrated an immigrant is the less willing he/she will be to return to the country of origin.97 Return to the lower income countries is relatively rare among migrants who were legally admitted on a longer term basis to the OECD countries.98 In cases of highly skilled immigrants this will lead to increased brain drain in the country of origin.99 Even though an emigrant would return to the country of origin “brain outflow may very rapidly have caused permanent losses to small, vulnerable countries, particularly when excessive emigration occurs from such vocational sectors as clinical medicine, daily education, or research and development of sectors instrumental to the national economy of the country of origin.”100 Tamas and Palme agree on this saying that “the exodus of skilled migrants, especially in the health professions, is one factor that deepen and protract underdevelopment and poor health conditions in regions such as…sub-Saharan Africa.”101

A prerequisite for return is economic and political progress in the country of origin that could give the migrant career opportunities and a better well-being.102 If a specific sector shrinks and becomes weaker because of brain drain, the possibilities for attractive work places decrease for potential returnee and might lead to further brain drain.103

3.4.4 Remittances, not always a driver for development

Remittances were 40 per cent higher than the total of all official development aid in year 2001. Remittances are as well larger than all capital flows, public and private, in 36 out of 153 developing countries.104 Özden and Schiff add to the understanding saying that “Remittances generally reduce poverty and alter income distribution, but the extent and direction of these effects depend on who receives them.”105 Tanner declares that even though remittances are “massive in quantity and often positive in effects” they are

---

97 Tanner 2005: p.43
98 Lucas 2005: p.15
99 Tanner 2005: p.45
100 Tanner 2005: p.47
101 Tamas and Palme 2006: p.20
102 Tanner 2005: p.49
103 Tanner 2005: p.50
104 Tanner 2005: p.53
105 Özden and Schiff undated: p.6
“only beneficial as a short-term support for the emigrant-sending elites, in relatively well-off developing countries, and/or during sudden conflicts and downturns. Remittances are not, however, the best drivers for equality-increasing long-term economic development.”

Remittances seem not to reach the poorest countries and the poorest part of the population in a country. Sub Saharan Africa receives relatively small amounts, and the remittances seem to decrease unlike trends in other regions. As most of the legal migrants from SSA tend to belong to the elites, most remittances reach the upper classes in society and will be used for the personal expenses of those families. Income gaps widen and could lead to social tensions rather than to development. According to Tamas Ron Skeldon has argued that “remittances are as likely to lead to poverty alleviation as to increased inequality”. Relative deprivation could increase among the excluded poor when remittances are unevenly distributed geographically and socially.

According to Tanner the more integrated the immigrants get the less they remit. To keep remittances stable an increasing amount of migrants are needed. Remitted amounts are often highest three to twelve years after migration and then decline as ties to home loosen. Another effect of remittances is that they could lead to a situation where passive family members just wait for remittances from abroad. Remittances could as well create an illusion of development and “may also cause sluggishness in innovation, excessive international dependency, and increasing “materialism”.

3.4.5 Labour migration a complex and morally demanding decision

A country opening up for labour migration will have to deal with complex and morally demanding decisions. A responsible policy-making process is important. The process should include “a careful forecast, as well as open public dialogue, about possible social
effects, such as brain drain, and other challenges to the country of origin.”\textsuperscript{116} Tanner states that recruiting countries have not been responsible enough for problems like brain drain in countries of origin caused by labour migration, giving Canada and New Zealand as examples.\textsuperscript{117} In order to gain from immigration “the developed world in need of labour is creating immigration systems that find immigrants with “success” characteristics and integrating them.”\textsuperscript{118} Labour emigration is “healthy but only to a limited extent, in certain times of need, and from well prepared countries. In the case of extensive migratory flows from highly-skilled professionals from critical branches, or in the case of the most vulnerable countries, any voluntary emigration, even in a temporary form, would be excessive.”\textsuperscript{119}

4 Migration from an African perspective

In order to give the debate an African perspective a short presentation of African migration will be outlined in this chapter. Push and pull factors will be accounted for and remittances and brain circulation will be discussed in an African context. One important point of departure is the views of the AU as they represent the African nations.

According to the African Union, Africa is experiencing an important increase in migratory flows, a trend that is likely to persist.\textsuperscript{120} Three per cent of the world’s population are living in countries in which they were not born,\textsuperscript{121} almost 1/3 of these are estimated to be Africans.\textsuperscript{122} The migration is mainly, and by tradition, within the continent but does also occur towards Europe, North America and some Middle East countries.\textsuperscript{123} The reason for migrating is due to both voluntary and involuntary factors but surveys indicate an increasing degree of voluntary, highly skilled, labour emigration.\textsuperscript{124} The highly skilled have easier access to both legal and illegal

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{enumerate}
\item Tanner 2005: p.42
\item Ibid.
\item Tanner 2005: p.45
\item Tanner 2005: p.49
\item African Common Position on Migration and Development 2006
\item IOM Facts and Figures
\item African Common Position on Migration and Development 2006
\item Ibid.
\item Tanner 2005: p.84
\end{enumerate}
\end{footnotesize}
immigration to North America and Europe. At the same time the numbers of returnees have decreased. African countries lose 20,000 skilled personnel to the developed world every year according to the African Capacity Building Foundation (ACBF).

The root causes of migration are numerous and complex, which especially is the case of SSA. Referring to Zelinsky’s basic push and pull framework the AU tries to outline the most important explanations. Poor socio-economic conditions such as: low wages, unemployment, rural underdevelopment, poverty and lack of opportunity are amongst the main reasons for people to migrate as well as population growth and low capacity to exploit available resources, poor governance, political instability, insecurity, human rights violations and environmental factors. The hope for a better life with better opportunities to education and high income, better access to health care and greater security are among the pull factors. Improved communications, greater information availability, a need/want to join relatives in combination with lower costs boost the push and pull factors. According to Tanner, increasing overpopulation in combination with the possibility of higher salaries and a better working environment are the strongest factors behind the increasing migration. This is the same situation as for the Europeans migrating to the US. There is a big difference though in that the sending countries in Europe were facing increased economic growth and a slowdown in demographic growth, which is not the case in contemporary Africa. In combination with the shift from mass migration to selective migration the impacts of migration might be different for Africa than it was for Europe. AU states that selective migration is a threat to African economies and according to IOM the migration hits source countries more. They need to allocate resources in order to control irregular migration which causes budget constraints; at the same time they lose skilled individuals who are essential to their countries’ economic and social development. As many countries in SSA have a severe lack of skilled personnel in some fields they are more vulnerable to

---

125 Tanner 2005: p.91
126 Tanner 2005: p.87
127 Sriskadarajah, 2005: p.1
128 African Common Position on Migration and Development 2006
129 Tanner 2005: p.94
130 Tanner 2005: p.95
131 International Dialogue on Migration 2005: p.23
132 African Common Position on Migration and Development 2006
133 International Dialogue on Migration 2005: p.23
brain drain. This is especially the case within the health sector where many countries in SSA have less than 20 nurses per 100 000 in the population (in some developed countries the figure is 50 times more).\(^{134}\)

All the developed world’s efforts to increase aid to these countries may not matter if the local personnel required to implement development programs are absent.\(^{135}\) Policy makers in Africa therefore need to address the unemployment crises in order to keep the young educated from migrating, it is also important to attract the Diasporas to return.\(^{136}\) ACBF calls for the need to invest substantial resources in regenerating skills, knowledge and institutions, and they recognize some broad trends for the continent as a whole to prioritise, even if they recognize the need of context specific solutions. The prioritised areas encompass good governance, rural development, education and gender consciousness, health, infrastructure and private sector development,\(^{137}\) efforts that probably would not only regenerate skills but mitigate migration and create an environment conducive for brain circulation.

It is often argued that remittances from the Diaspora contribute to the development of the country of origin. Publications by the World Bank and IMF indicate that the remittances have been of crucial importance to many SSA families and that the Diaspora constitutes the biggest group of investors in Africa.\(^{138}\) It is private transfers though and should not be confused with official means. It is also questioned how much the remittances are in reality. A report from the IOM considers that the data for remittances to Africa are scarce, unreliable and probably very low and volatile.\(^{139}\)

In order to gain substantial positive impact for the development of the origin countries AU recognizes the necessity of well-managed migration. They state that badly managed migration leads to negative consequences for both countries and individuals and they call for better institutional capacity, in some countries, to address the problems linked to migration.\(^{140}\) A well-managed migration addresses the issue in a more holistic manner

\(^{134}\) Tamas 2006: p.18-19
\(^{135}\) Sriskadarajah 2005: p.1
\(^{136}\) Adepoju 2004
\(^{137}\) ACBF 2005
\(^{138}\) Tanner 2005: p.121-124
\(^{139}\) Ibid.
\(^{140}\) African Common Position on Migration and Development 2006
and not only as recourse to security measures. This would involve problems that are related to the movement of people, the protection of rights and the linkage between migration and development and AU calls for actions on national, continental and international levels.\textsuperscript{141}

**Figure 2 Some facts on African Migration\textsuperscript{142}**

- Over a third of all college-educated citizens in 40 per cent of the African countries are emigrants.
- African has seen a decline in its share of international migrants from 12 per cent in 1970 to 9 per cent in 2000.
- Developing countries do according to some estimations supply 56 per cent of all migrating physicians and receive less than 11 per cent.
- 61 per cent of the graduates as medical doctors from Ghana’s main medical school in 1986-1996 did migrated.

5 Presentation of material

In the following chapter, the report analysed will be presented, its point of departure and a summary of the proposal for a new labour immigration policy. As the analysis is made in light of the Swedish policy for global development, a brief summary of the Bill is also presented.

5.1 The Committee on Labour Immigration’s final report

In February 2004 the Government instructed The Committee on Labour Immigration to propose a regulatory framework that will allow more extensive labour immigration from countries outside the EU/EEA and Switzerland. The regulations should meet both short and long term needs and therefore be formulated within a flexible and sustainable framework. In response to this, the Committee presented in October 2006 their final report “Arbetskraftsinvandring till Sverige – förslag och konsekvenser”.

\textsuperscript{141} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{142} Tamas 2006: p.18-19, IOM Facts and Figures
In their final report, the Committee present their working process as well as a proposal on legislative changes. In the analysis, special attention is drawn to their international outlook and the chapter on consequences for the country of origin, as well as the appendix concerning the instructions from the government and the future prognosis on supply and demand on labour.

5.1.1 The Committee’s points of departure

The work of the Committee has proceeded from three basic assumptions:

1. Migration is a social phenomenon that is increasing in volume and contributes to the development of society. Migration has always existed and will continue to do so, probably on an increasing scale. There will always be a need to regulate the phenomenon in various ways.

2. The demographic trend towards an ageing population, and the increasing dependency burden this entails for the working population, can have adverse structural consequences for the labour market and for the country’s economy. An ageing population can also lead to a loss of dynamism in the labour market. Increased labour immigration can help alleviate these effects.

3. Labour immigration can help vitalize the Swedish labour market and economy but can also generate negative effects.

Throughout the process further assumptions have been added;

4. The need of skilled professionals will increase with variations over time and regions.

5. The high-income countries will more and more compete in attracting well educated personnel from other countries.

6. In the area of labour migration, the aim is always to benefit the host country.

7. Migration also contributes to development in the countries of origin as remittances are sent home and as the migrants return with new skills.

The Committee agrees on that Sweden needs to continue regulating labour immigration, the reasons for this are:

1. Regulated labour immigration puts focus on the need for manpower and does thus not shut out manpower already available in the country from the labour market.
2. It will ensure equal treatment for people who immigrate to work as for employees already in the country. In order to guarantee this, the decision on work permits should rest ultimately with a government agency.

3. Government agencies should facilitate positive impact on the Swedish labour market and economy through regulated labour immigration.

4. The Swedish welfare system is essentially open to anyone who lives in Sweden. This service naturally also applies to people who immigrate to work and their families.

5.1.2 A summary of the Proposal of the Committee

In figure 3 and 4 the current and proposed legal framework are summarised to enable comparison. Subsequently the various types of permits and visas in the proposal of the Committee are elaborated further.

**Figure 3** Current Permits

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kind of permit</th>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Category</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Permanent Permit on labour market grounds</td>
<td>No Limit</td>
<td>Limited to persons who possess special qualifications and who have been offered permanent employment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temporary work permits on labour shortage grounds</td>
<td>18 months. Possible extension for 6 months</td>
<td>Temporary shortage Person with qualified working education and experience in times of temporary shortage</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temporary work permits on labour shortage grounds</td>
<td>Maximum of 3 months</td>
<td>Seasonal work permits In following sectors: agriculture, gardening and forestry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temporary work permits (International exchange)</td>
<td>Maximum of 48 months</td>
<td>International exchange programmes supervisors/specialists in international companies or group of companies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temporary work permits (International exchange)</td>
<td>Maximum of 18 months</td>
<td>Trainee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temporary work permits (International exchange)</td>
<td>Maximum of 12 months</td>
<td>Au Pair</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

143 SOU 2006:87: p.128
Temporary work permits on labour shortage grounds

In order to get a temporary work permit, a person must have been offered employment in a field where there is a manpower shortage and the income must be adequate to support the employee. The permit shall be linked to a certain occupation and initially, to a certain employer. The Committee proposes an extension of the period of validity of temporary permits and the possibility to convert the permit into a permanent one. According to the Committee, this will benefit the Swedish labour market and will make Sweden more competitive with other high-income countries. A minority of the Committee propose that there should be no limit to the possibility to apply for extension of the permit. They further want a possibility to apply for citizenship after five years.

---

International exchange programmes and Seasonal work permits
The Committee proposes no significant changes from today’s regulations.

Permanent residence permits on labour market grounds
Permanent residence permits on labour market grounds should be granted only to persons who posses special qualifications and who have been offered permanent employment within their field.

Conditions for family members
A fundamental principle in Swedish migration policy is that the nuclear family should be kept together as far as possible, family members of persons granted permits in labour market grounds should therefore be granted permits to the same extent as presently. The Committee believes this entails a competitive advantage for Sweden.

Job-seeker visas
The Committee proposes a possibility to grant a job-seeker visa to a third country national for a period of maximum three months. To be granted a visa, the applicant must have a profession for which there is an explicit need of manpower. The Labour Market Administration should keep a list of professions that can be considered. The Migration board decides on the application in cooperation with the Labour Market Administration.

Agency-based labour market consideration
In order to ensure there is no available manpower within Sweden, EEA or Switzerland suitable for the vacancies and to ensure equal rights and treatment of employees from a third country, an agency-based labour market consideration should be retained. The majority of the members of the Committee propose that this task should remain within the Labour Market Administration and that they shall obtain statements from the relevant trade union.

Work permits for visiting students
The Committee proposes measures to make it easier for visiting students to apply for and be granted a work permit.

Permits for self-employed persons
Minor changes are proposed to make it more difficult to abuse the regulations.
Asylum-seekers and the labour market
The majority of the Committee recommends no changes to the current regulations whilst a minority propose that temporary permits should be applicable inside Sweden and that this right should include asylum-seekers who have been denied asylum.

5.1.3 Dissenting opinions
The dissenting opinions within the Committee, mainly relate to in which way the labour market considerations should be handled. A minority of the members propose that these considerations should be done by the employers; another proposal is an exception from the agency-based labour market consideration in certain occupations where a need is already explicit stated. Other dissenting opinions applies to when a labour immigrant shall be allowed to apply for citizenship, the ability to apply for work permit whilst in Sweden, to what extent the work permit should be connected to an occupation, the ability to regularise illegal workers and so forth.145

The Swedish elections in September 2006 led to a new government consisting mainly of the parties which had dissenting opinions in the Committee. This means that the dissenting opinions now could turn into the official policy. The Government is working on a memorandum on the Governments official outlook.146 The final report will then be circulated for considerations together with the memorandum. According to Rönneklev at the Ministry of Justice the memorandum mainly consists of administrative considerations.

5.2 Shared Responsibility – Sweden’s Policy for Global Development
Bill 2002/03:122 – Sweden’s policy for Global Development (PGD) is a response to the awareness that global development is dependent on different policy areas not only those traditionally focusing on development issues. The motive of the policy is solidarity. “The policy should be based on the view that all human beings are equal in dignity and rights, on Sweden’s solidarity with poor and vulnerable people in other countries and recognition of our shared responsibility for the future of the world.”147

145 SOU 2006:87
146 Rönneklev 2007
147 Bill 2002/03:122: p.19
The aim of Bill 2002/03:122 is to reach coherence between policy areas to achieve positive, not contradicting effects for development. The target group for this development is poor people in developing and transition countries.\(^{148}\) The objective of the bill is to contribute to equitable and sustainable development and should apply to all policy areas for example trade, agriculture, environment, security, migration, as well as international development cooperation. A rights perspective based on international human rights convention; and the perspective of the poor are central in the PGD and should be taken into account in all policy areas.

The Swedish policy for global development is formulated with respect to eight thematic areas grouped under four headings:\(^ {149}\)

- “Fundamental values: respect for human rights, democracy, good governance and gender equality
- Sustainable development: sustainable use of natural resources and protection of the environment, economic growth, social development and security
- Conflict management and security
- Global public goods and global challenges: transboundary issues requiring joint decisions and action on the part of the international community”

Along with the overall purpose to contribute to equitable and sustainable development, the PGD also provides more specific goals for each policy area. For migration policy, this is narrowed down and formulated in four objectives:\(^ {150}\)

- “Sweden should take an active part in global cooperation to establish better arrangements and rules for orderly migration.
- Sweden should contribute to the shaping of a long-term EU policy for effectively managed labour mobility, and should in particular draw attention to the benefits of such a policy for developing countries.
- Sweden should continue to uphold the right of asylum by pursuing a legally correct and humane asylum and refugee policy, and by giving substantial political and economic support to the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR).

\(^{148}\) Comm. 2005/06:204: p.3
\(^{149}\) Ibid.
\(^{150}\) Bill 2002/03:122: p.40
• Sweden should make efforts to strengthen the development impact of remittances sent by migrants to their country of origin."

The responsibility to implement the PGD lies upon every policy area. The PGD does not replace the different objectives of different policy areas but every area should consider every possibility to contribute to equitable and sustainable development.¹⁵¹

6 Swedish migration policies in perspective

To give an understanding of the context of the work of the Committee on Labour Immigration a brief summary of the Swedish migration policies coverage and today’s labour immigration policies will be presented in this chapter.

In 1996 Sweden adopted a migration policy with a global approach.¹⁵² The migration policy does thereafter cover refugee, immigration, integration and return policies and is a part of foreign, security, trade and development assistance policies.¹⁵³ This policy basis should now be attuned with the objectives of the Policy for Global Development. Considering potential future labour migration Kristof Tamas proposes that it should be coordinated with the policies for the labour market as well.¹⁵⁴

The labour immigration policy in Sweden is restrictive and regulated. Decisions are taken by the central Aliens affairs agency, i.e. The Swedish Migration Board, after labour market considerations. Persons with special skills or who are offered employment within sectors with labour shortage are the ones that can be granted permits, if the requirements can not be met by jobseekers within the country or the EEA and Switzerland. The legislative framework leads to a selective immigration of manpower.¹⁵⁵

¹⁵¹ Peyre Dutrey 2006: p.5
¹⁵² Bill 1996/97:25
¹⁵³ www.migrationsverket.se
¹⁵⁴ Tamas 2006: p.39
¹⁵⁵ SOU 2006:87: p.18-19
7 Results

In order to answer the questions of interest the final report of the Committee on Labour Immigration has been analysed in the light of the PGD and on the basis of the theoretical framework. The result and the analysis will be structured in two sub-chapters, one on each question of interest followed by a concluding discussion.

7.1 Policy Coherence

The first question will here be dealt with: Does the Committee on Labour Immigration take the objectives of the Government Bill 2002/03:122 into consideration in their proposal of a new policy for labour immigration to Sweden?

When making a study on policy coherence the first question to answer, according to Forster and Stokke, is “for what and for whom” coherence is to be achieved. In the PGD the aim is to obtain coherent policies in order to reach the overruling objective of equitable and sustainable global development. The central target groups are poor people and poor countries. In order to achieve this, all policy areas of the Swedish Government should be permeated by a rights perspective and the perspectives of the poor. Migration is one of the five areas prioritized in the PGD, since it directly affects the targeted groups. It is therefore of particular importance that the proposal for a new labour immigration policy reflects the PGD and contributes as far as possible to an equitable and sustainable global development. This is a difficult task for the Committee, but important as coherent policies are a prerequisite for global development.

7.1.1 The perspectives of the poor

According to the PGD “Integrating the perspectives of the poor will involve shifting the balance of power from rich countries to poor ones and from governments to individuals and groups.” This is directly contradicted by the Committee on Labour Immigration when they reach the conclusion that: “with the respect to labour migration, the aim is always to benefit the host country”. Further on they state that the objective for labour immigration is to reach a positive result for the employee, the employer and the

156 Peyre Dutrey 2006: p.5
157 Bill 2002/03:122: p.22
158 SOU 2006:87: p.37
society\textsuperscript{159}, leaving the countries of origin out. In order to integrate the perspective of the poor the Committee has conducted a survey on the impacts on the sending countries asking for opinions from Swedish embassies. Referring to this survey they consider that migration has both negative and positive effects on the countries of origin but “it appears that the positive factors outweigh the negative in many emigrant countries.”\textsuperscript{160} This is stated by the Committee with no further discussion or references.

In the instructions from the government the Committee is asked to prepare a proposal that meet the need of manpower on the Swedish labour market, regarding equal rights for employees. In the prognosis referred to by the Committee the need of personnel is mainly high skilled labour in the sectors of health, education, industry and technology. The ability to get a permit is linked to the need in different sectors. Even the ability to get a job seeker visa depends on skills. According to Tanner emigration of highly skilled workers will lead to increased brain drain. Developing countries are particularly vulnerable to losing skilled manpower in sectors such as medicine, education, research and development since these are important sectors in building a nation’s economy.\textsuperscript{161} As the labour needs of the destination countries in the future will be within the same sectors which are critical for development in SSA there is a risk for brain drain. According to GCIM the health care sector is severely affected in SSA, to such an extent that if not combated it will undermine the progress to reach the health-related objectives of the Millennium Development Goals.\textsuperscript{162} This contradict with the overall objective of the PGD to reach a more equitable and sustainable development.

\textbf{7.1.2 The rights perspective}

The rights perspective in the PGD “focuses on the discriminated, excluded and marginalized individuals and groups…This perspective helps to identify areas in which special actions are required to ensure that the effects of various decisions are as fare as possible.”\textsuperscript{163} According to GCIM, every third country both in the north and the south follows principles to decrease immigration.\textsuperscript{164} This is verified by the Committee as they

\begin{itemize}
\item\textsuperscript{159} SOU 2006:87: p.40
\item\textsuperscript{160} SOU 2006:87: p.38
\item\textsuperscript{161} Tanner 2005: p.47
\item\textsuperscript{162} GCIM 2005: p.24
\item\textsuperscript{163} Bill 2002/03:122: p.21
\item\textsuperscript{164} Tamas 2006: p.9
\end{itemize}
point out that one of the aims with regulated migration policies is to shut out unwanted persons. Globalisation, the process for increased ability of market flows across national borders, has yet not included personal flows which are still confronted with a wide range of official controls. According to the PGD “One important challenge will be to find new arrangements for organized migration so that people’s desire to pursue a better life in a new country can become a positive force for global development to a greater extent than at present.” In regard to the rights perspective, as stated in the PGD it is problematic that the proposal put forward by the Committee, includes specific groups of skilled manpower and thereby exclude more marginalized individuals and groups. The PGD emphasize that the mobility of the poor is still limited. Peyre Dutrey refer to that the minister of migration, Tobias Billström, has stated that labour migration will open up for poor migrants. As labour migration is supposed to depend on the need in the destination country, Peyre Dutrey notices that this statement contradicts with the analyses made by the Committee on future manpower needs.

The Committee argues that by creating possibilities for labour immigration, legal migration will increase and reduce the illegal migration to the same extent. One of the reasons for regulated migration emphasized by the Committee is to protect equal rights for labour immigrants as for national manpower. This is important as illegal labour migrants are amongst the most marginalized in the society.

7.1.3 Promote return

The explicit objectives of the PGD in the area of migration are among others to manage labour mobility on a national level as well as on EU level and to draw attention to the benefits for developing countries. The Committee has chosen to emphasize that the PGD calls for more efforts to improve opportunities for people in developing countries to study abroad and then return home with new skills. Special attention should be drawn to the interests of the developing countries. At the same time the instructions for the

---

165 SOU 2006:87: p.19
166 GCIM 2005: p.9
168 Ibid.
169 Peyre Dutrey Interview 070308
170 SOU 2006:87: p.94
171 SOU 2006:87: p.22
172 SOU 2006:87: p.261
Committee are to consider the possibilities for guest students to stay in Sweden and work.\textsuperscript{173} This creates a conflict of objectives. The Committee has followed the instructions by the Government which result in a proposal that does not make it easier for students to get visas, as called for in the PGD, but to apply for residence and to be granted work permits during time of studies.\textsuperscript{174} This is not attuned with the objectives in the PGD to create better conditions for return and circulation.\textsuperscript{175} The possibility to work during studies is positive though as it enables remittances.

Regarding university students on scholarships financed by Swedish official development aid, ODA, the Committee has chosen to refer to the SOU 2006:7 report on school fees. The SOU 2006:7 finds it problematic that those students should get possibilities to stay in Sweden as the aim for the scholarship is to contribute to the country of origin. They do not object, however, as they claim it is common that students chose to go to a third country instead of return to their home countries: “In that perspective there are reasons to see the Swedish contribution as more long-termed and to create possibilities even for this category of students to stay in Sweden to work and hereby hopefully enrich the Swedish working life and, in the long run, the country of birth.”\textsuperscript{176} The Committee does not further comment on this. In a PGD perspective they should at least have called for more actions that promote return and not justify their proposal by referring to the SOU 2006:7 report.

7.1.4 The PGD in the report

In the report, the Committee has discussed possible negative consequences of labour immigration for the countries of origin, without considering this in their final proposal. Instead the positive outcomes are highlighted. Peyre Dutrey agrees with this observation and that the Committee seems to have misunderstood that the responsibility for implementing the PGD lies within each policy area.\textsuperscript{177} Instead the Committee delegates the responsibility to the policies for global development, as stated in the report “the special responsibility Sweden has with regard to development in poor countries should

\begin{itemize}
\item\textsuperscript{173} SOU 2006:87: p.173
\item\textsuperscript{174} SOU 2006:87: p.176
\item\textsuperscript{175} Bill 2002/03:122: p.41
\item\textsuperscript{176} SOU 2006:87: p.175 “I det perspektivet finns det skäl att se den svenska insatsen som mera långsiktig och att ge möjlighet även för denna kategori studenter att stanna för arbete i Sverige och härigenom förhoppningsvis berika både det svenska arbetslivet och, på längre sikt, hemlandet.”
\item\textsuperscript{177} Peyre Dutrey Interview 070308
\end{itemize}
be managed within the framework of the policy for global development”\textsuperscript{178} and further on “it is within this policy that the structures for this should be developed”.\textsuperscript{179} It seems as if the Committee has not considered their responsibility demanded for by the policy for global development. As a consequence they have not managed to integrate the objectives of the PGD in the report.

\subsection*{7.1.5 Summary}

\textit{Does the Committee on Labour Immigration regard the objectives of the Government Bill 2002/03:122 in their proposal to a new policy for labour immigration to Sweden?}

Each policy area is supposed to fulfil their own objectives in a way that regards the objectives outlined in the PGD. This study finds, however, that the Committee has not managed to present a proposal which meets the interests of the central target groups of the PGD and have thus not taken on the responsibility demanded for by the Policy for Global Development. Instead the Committee refers to the PGD as being responsible for policies leading to the development of poor countries. Subsequently, this study finds that the Committee does not fully regard the objectives of the Swedish Policy for Global Development, where all policies should contribute to equitable and sustainable development.

\section*{7.2 Conditions for win-win-win, created or not?}

In this sub-chapter the second question of interest for the thesis will be answered: Does the proposal for a new labour immigration policy create conditions for brain circulation and a win-win-win situation that contributes to sustainable and equitable development in the country of origin?

In order to answer the question, the consequences of the proposal for the country of origin, destination and the individual, will be analysed according to the theory on migration for development discussed earlier.

\textsuperscript{178} SOU 2006:87: p.50
\textsuperscript{179} SOU 2006:87: p.272 ”Detta ligger i linje med den svenska politiken för global utveckling och vi menar att det är inom denna politik som former för detta ska utvecklas”.
7.2.1 Country of origin

Consequences for the countries of origin and for developing countries are presented in two chapters of the report. The chapters are based on previous research made by Kristof Tamas, the Global Commission for International Migration and documents such as the PGD and UN reports. The Committee has also conducted their own survey, SOU 2005:50, making an international outlook partly through asking opinions from “concerned”\(^{180}\) Swedish embassies.

The point of departure for the reports’ consequence analysis is a UN charter with positive and negative consequences of migration for origin countries.\(^{181}\) The Committee does not find all these consequences relevant for labour immigration to Sweden though. They do not, for example, believe it will lead to less unemployment in the countries of origin as the manpower demanded is not likely to be unemployed or a part of the surplus in their home countries.\(^{182}\)

Through the questionnaires to the embassies, the Committee acknowledges the negative effects of brain drain in Southern Africa and the Philippines. At the same time they acknowledge the positive effects of returnees, remittances and the Diasporas engagement in their countries of origin.\(^{183}\) Countries with an active policy for emigration are used as examples on positive effects and as proof that emigration has positive effects to the economy in the country of origin. Three countries are mentioned, Philippines, Sri Lanka and Vietnam, without providing any further discussion about whether these are representative for all the countries of origin.\(^{184}\)

Brain circulation

The Committee highlights previous research saying that returning labour immigrants are a potential for development in countries of origin and that the responsibilities for this lie on both sending and receiving countries.\(^{185}\) Earlier in the report, the Committee considers through previous experience of labour immigration from the EU\(^{15}\)\(^{186}\) that

\(^{180}\) According to the SOU 2005:50: p.16 “berörda”
\(^{181}\) Appendix 3
\(^{182}\) SOU 2006:87: p.262
\(^{183}\) SOU 2006:87: p.263
\(^{184}\) SOU 2006:87: p.101-103
\(^{185}\) SOU 2006:87: p.123
\(^{186}\) The 15 members of the EU up to 30 April 2004
labour immigrants tend to return more frequently than other groups of immigrants. Return further increase if the immigrant is followed by a family.\textsuperscript{187} In a reflection, made by the Committee, they state that there is a possibility that future labour immigrants might tend to stay longer in Sweden as the situation in their countries of origin is poorer as compared to the EEA countries. This might also increase with the fact that the proposal allows longer permits and possibility to gain permanent permit to stay in Sweden.\textsuperscript{188} According to the theory used in the thesis, this reflection is worthy noticing as Tanner puts forward that a prerequisite for return are economic and political progress in the country of origin giving the migrants opportunities to a career and a better well-being.\textsuperscript{189} Tobisson and Peyre Dutrey see that development aid and support to capacity building within certain sectors and research institutions could be a part of the solution. In order to promote circular migration, there is a need for something to return to. It is important to create structures for sustainable development within the country. Peyre Dutrey calls for more “islands to land upon” for the intellectual African. As an example he argues that within social science, the alternatives in Africa are scarce.\textsuperscript{190} This proves the need for coherence between migration and development policies. Migration policies alone can not create conditions for brain circulation.

In the judgement by the Committee individual migrants could affect the development in their country of origin to different extent depending on their skills and position. The Committee shares the opinion that immigrants who return can contribute to development in their countries of origin and that the possibilities to do so increase if the migrant holds capital. They further state that contribution can happen even if the immigrant chooses to settle in Sweden. The Committee believes that temporary work permits lead to more returnees and thereby adds to the development in the countries of origin. As the labour immigrant will gain experience and knowledge from the start, since they have an employment on arrival the Committee finds that their proposal creates good conditions for brain circulation.\textsuperscript{191} Temporary work permits are as well

\textsuperscript{187} SOU 2006:87: p.123, 238-239
\textsuperscript{188} SOU 2006:87: p.239
\textsuperscript{189} Tanner 2005: p.49
\textsuperscript{190} Peyre Dutrey Interview 070308
\textsuperscript{191} SOU 2006:87: p.271-272
suggested by GCIM to be the best solution for the country of origin in situations of labour migration as such a program may lead to positive development.\textsuperscript{192}

Based on theory, it seems as even though temporary labour migration results in brain circulation, vulnerable countries could be affected in a negative way. According to Tanner brain outflow could have turned to brain drain even though a person returns to the country of origin.\textsuperscript{193} If a doctor emigrates from a country with an acute lack of personnel the effects are immediate. Even if the doctor returns with new skills the damage is already done. In such a case the net loss in talent and educational costs for the society has to be compensated otherwise brain circulation do not gain development.\textsuperscript{194} According to Tobisson and Peyre Dutrey monetary compensation for the losses is sometimes demanded for by the AU and others. There is no support for this however in the EU or the other countries of the North. According to Tobisson monetary compensation is not coherent with the Paris Agenda that calls for responsibility from both the North and the South.\textsuperscript{195}

**Remittances**

Remittances are mentioned by the Committee as a positive outcome of labour migration. They state that remittances are of great importance, not only for the migrant families, but for their countries economy.\textsuperscript{196} As stated above the importance of remittances to Africa is questionable though. An IOM report does consider that data for remittances to Africa are scarce and unreliable and probably low and volatile.\textsuperscript{197} A study at the Harvard University shows that SSA receives the least amount of remittances and unlike trends in other regions; these have not increased over the past years.\textsuperscript{198} According to Tanner; remittances seem not to reach the poorest countries or the poorest part of the countries, concluding that “…remittances are not, however, the best drivers for equality-increasing long-term economic development.”\textsuperscript{199} If remittances are unevenly distributed, geographically and socially, tensions could arise rather than development.\textsuperscript{200}

\textsuperscript{192} Karlsson 2006: p.38
\textsuperscript{193} Tanner 2005: p.47
\textsuperscript{194} Tanner 2005: p.17-19
\textsuperscript{195} Peyre Dutrey and Tobisson Interview 070308
\textsuperscript{196} SOU 2006:87: p.263
\textsuperscript{197} Tanner, 2005: p.121-124
\textsuperscript{198} Tanner, 2005: p.117
\textsuperscript{199} Tanner 2005: p.65
\textsuperscript{200} Tanner 2005: p.58-59
Eva Tobisson means that remittances could create dependency and passive family members. An example could be youth giving up work as they are supported by remittances. The relevance of the Committees’ conclusions on remittances is therefore questionable from a PGD perspective. There might be positive effects for development but evidence show that this might be slight or counter-productive in the poorest countries.

7.2.2 Destination country

The overruling purpose of a more generous labour immigration policy is to meet the demands for manpower on the Swedish labour market. Immigrants from third countries might, according to the Committee, be a beneficial supplement that prevents the negative consequences followed by labour shortage. The forecasted shortage is a consequence of demographic changes.

In the report, the Committee has calculated the economic consequences for Sweden and have reached the conclusion that the society will make direct economic gains. The income from taxes and fees will exceed transfer costs and public service consumptions. The basis for their analysis is that immigrants will be young upon arrival and will leave before pension. The costs for education, health care and elderly service will be borne by their countries of origin. This will affect the vulnerable countries most and is not coherent with an equitable and sustainable development. GCIM states that the countries in SSA already have had serious losses in investing in education for persons that leave the country to work elsewhere. Health staff migrates to more prosperous countries in the region like South Africa and Botswana but also to countries in Europe. There is therefore a need to take aspects of coherence in consideration when formulating policies on migration to create better conditions for brain circulation and limit the negative impacts on the countries of origin.

Another important aspect highlighted by the Committee is the integration to the Swedish society. As labour immigrants have employment upon arrival, the number of

201 Tobisson Interview 070308
202 SOU 2006:87: p.30
203 SOU 2006:87: p.35-36
204 SOU 2006:87: p.30, 259
foreign born on the Swedish labour market will increase. The Committee believes that this could lead to trickle down effects and that more immigrants get employment and, if so, in the long run have positive effects on the attitude towards immigrants. As emphasized by the Committee integration is important for the individual as well as for the destination country. There is a risk that integration could lead to increased brain drain in the country of origin. According to the theory on brain circulation, the more integrated an immigrant is the less willing he/she will be to return. The will to remit will as well be affected with integration, as the more integrated a person is and the longer a person stays abroad, the less interested he/she will be to remit.

Increased labour migration could lead to that Swedish manpower meets competition in the labour market and that wages decrease. This risk has been accounted for in the instructions by the government and is therefore considered in the report of the Committee. This is one of the main reasons for a selective immigration policy. Depending on which sectors that will demand manpower, this could affect the countries of origin in a way that counteract the objectives of the PGD.

One point of departure for the Committee has been that competition over manpower will be a reality in the future. Due to demographic changes there will be lack of skilled manpower within the EU. Bearing this in mind the Committee believes permits of longer periods, due to the possibility of getting a temporary permit changed into a permanent one as well as the fact that the immigrant can bring their family, will improve Sweden’s competitive advantages. A competition for skilled manpower could severely affect the countries of origin. As discussed above, the suggestions made by the Committee can lead to a decrease of returnees to the countries of origin. Peyre Dutrey sees a risk for “accelerating drainage” of skilled manpower when the same kinds of skills are on demand in the developed countries. Providing permits for longer periods as well as the possibility to get a temporary permit changed into a permanent one, as competitive advantages, is contradicting to the standpoint made by the

---

206 SOU 2006:87: p.228-230
207 Tanner 2005: p. 45
209 SOU 2006:87: p.46-47
210 SOU 2006:87: p.24-26
212 Peyre Dutrey Interview 070308
Committee that temporary work permits lead to more returnees and thereby contribute to the development in the countries of origin.\textsuperscript{213}

### 7.2.3 Individual success

Already in the instructions, the government stresses the importance to protect the immigrants and their right to equal treatment. This does not only include legal frameworks related to the labour market but the welfare system as a whole.\textsuperscript{214}

Labour immigration is associated with risks for the immigrant, the employer and the society. In order to minimize the risks, the Committee proposes a shared responsibility between the three parts, where the society through its agencies is responsible for protecting the rights of the individual and its family.\textsuperscript{215}

A fundamental principle in Swedish migration policy is that the nuclear family should be kept together as far as possible. Family members of persons granted permits on labour market grounds should therefore be granted permits to the same extent as presently, with no labour market consideration.

A permit based on the need of labour is connected to a certain sector and to begin with to a certain employer. As the Committee propose permits of longer periods the risk for the immigrant to lose employment increases. The Committee therefore proposes that the authorities should be able to call back a granted permit but also gives the opportunity for the individual to apply for a new job and a new permit within the country.\textsuperscript{216} The Committee also proposes extended possibilities for students to apply for residence and work permits within the country and that guest students who are qualified to post-graduated programmes should be granted work permits without having to undergo labour market considerations.\textsuperscript{217}

For the individuals included, the proposal seems to create a win situation as it protects their equal rights, allows them to bring their family, creates extended possibilities to

\textsuperscript{213} SOU 2006:87: p.271-272  
\textsuperscript{214} SOU 2006:87: p.293  
\textsuperscript{215} SOU 2006:87: p.22  
\textsuperscript{216} SOU 2006:87: p.25, 135-138  
\textsuperscript{217} SOU 2006:87: p.47, 176
apply for permits within the country and to have their permits changed into a permanent one. The fact that the permit is closely linked to a certain employer causes a risk for the individual however, the Committee has though, by proposing a possibility to stay and apply for another job, tried to limit the risk. The proposal excludes many groups by the labour market consideration and for these groups it does not create conditions for a win situation. The poor and uneducated are groups that will be excluded since they do not possess the demanded skills. The proposal thereby contradicts on the perspective of the poor in the PGD. Since these are the ones usually marginalised and shut out from the globalisation process, the proposal even contradicts with the rights perspective.

7.2.4 Summary

Does the proposal for a new policy create conditions for brain circulation and a win-win-win situation that contribute to sustainable and equitable development in the country of origin?

The Committee believes that migration benefits emigrant countries in two ways: through brain circulation and remittances. According to their own opinion the proposal creates good conditions for return through temporary work permits. This is contradicted in the proposal, however, which rather creates opportunities for migrants to stay in Sweden by suggesting increased possibilities for extended work permits and permanent permits, as well as arguing for the importance of integration. It may be true that this could lead to increased remittances, but according to the studies presented in the theoretical framework this does not automatically benefit the poor.

The Committee recognises the need for more action to promote return but does not go into detail since they believe this should be managed within the PGD. This is problematic as it contradicts the objectives of the PGD. In order to reach brain circulation that benefits the most vulnerable countries, concrete proposals for actions are needed within all concerned policy areas, which would in this case particularly mean the area of migration policy. The Committee has presented the consequences for the countries of origin in their report but has not regarded these findings in their final proposal. Even though the needs of individuals and the country of destination have been considered the proposal has not created conditions for a win-win-win situation since the
countries of origin have been disregarded. This is particularly true if the country of origin is among the most vulnerable. Instead the proposal might create increased problems for those countries, as it could lead to brain drain and thus contradict the idea of policy coherence for development.

8 Conclusions

The purpose of this study has been to examine the coherence between the Swedish migration policies concerning labour immigration and the objective of the PGD to contribute to equitable and sustainable global development. The study shows that the proposal put forward by the Committee on Labour Immigration to a large extent is not coherent with the objectives of the PGD. This indicates that the need for coherence has not permeated policy making in the field of migration.

When conducting a study on coherence the perspective, “for what and for whom”, is crucial for the outcome. The point of departure of this thesis is the perspectives of the poor and vulnerable countries in SSA, part of the central target group of the PGD. With another perspective the outcome would probably be different. As Sweden has adopted the PGD as a legal framework it is important to have this perspective in all policy making if equitable and sustainable development shall be obtained. Furthermore, the responsibility rests upon all policy makers and governmental institutions to achieve this goal. The result of this study has shown that this responsibility is not clear to all policymakers. There can be different reasons for this, where one probable reason is a lack of information and knowledge about the purpose of the PGD among policymakers. Even if the Committee was instructed to adapt a PGD perspective they seem not to have understood the meaning of this, in that sense the incoherence could be unintended, as defined by Hoebink. If the Government wants the rhetoric to be followed by action more effort on information need to be made.

Through the proposal suggested by the Committee the countries of origin face the risk of being the losers of migration which is contradictory to the objective of the PGD. The Committee predicts that there might be an increasing competition for skilled personnel between the EEA countries in certain sectors due to labour shortage. Many developing
countries are already facing shortages of skilled labour in sectors that are fundamental for building an economy, such as health and education. An increased outflow of skilled personnel, brain drain, might severely affect the chances these countries have to develop. Even if it is hard to predict from where the labour immigrants to Sweden will originate it is likely, due to the competition, that SSA will be affected. It is therefore serious that the Committee recognizes the need for more action to stimulate returns, but do not give any concrete proposals for how this should be done.

One problem with the suggested proposal is that it is very regulated and selective. A less regulated migration policy would also welcome people with a lower level of education. From a rights perspective this would mean inclusion of the more marginalized which would be more coherent with PGD. This could benefit the country of origin to a greater extent as it could decrease unemployment and as a consequence result in poverty relief.

Labour migration is a complex phenomenon as the aim is to bring benefits to the destination country by filling its demands for skilled personnel. At the same time it can lead to serious consequences for the country of origin. To avoid this, the importance of policy coherence is clear and ethic considerations called for.

A labour immigration policy that follows the directives of the PGD would lead to migration that contributes positively to development. This means that both migration policies and policies for development cooperation should consider the impacts of migration for development. As shown in this study the proposal put forward does not gain all actors and thereby does not create conditions for a win-win-win situation. Migration could be a positive force for development in both countries of origin and countries of destination. The crucial factor is to create policies that provide conditions for return. It is also important that the conditions in the countries of origin are improved, in order to attract returnees and avoid involuntary migration due to poor living and working standards. The main responsibility for this rests upon the countries themselves but ODA can contribute through capacity building, e.g. to support research and to create more attractive places of work. This proves the need for coherence between migration and development policies. Migration policies alone can not create conditions for brain circulation.
It is neither possible, nor a solution, to hinder migration. To make migration a source for development even for the most vulnerable countries, more research is needed. There is a lot of research made in the North but there is a need for research on migration for development from within the South. From a Swedish perspective it would be interesting to examine how the development cooperation integrates migration issues in their country strategies, projects and other initiatives. Another area of interest would be to study the interaction between Sida and the Migration Board.
9 List of references

Published:


Government Bill 2002/03:122, Shared Responsibility – Sweden’s Policy for global Development

Government Communication 2005/06:204, Sweden’s Global Development Policy


Triple C Evaluations no2, ECDPM, ICEI (2006) *EU mechanisms that promote policy coherence for development.* Amsterdam: Aksant Academic Publishers

**Unpublished:**

Odén, Bertil, Lundquist, Olof, Perspective no 5: *Coherence Vital for Global Development.* Center for African Studies at Gothenburg University


**Internet:**


Migrationsverket *On Migration* Available online www.migrationsverket.se (27 May 2007)


Özden, Caglar and Schiff, Maurice International Migration (undated): Brain drain or Brain Gain Available online yaleglobal.yale.edu/display.article?id=6428 (3 January 2007)

Interviews:

Peyre Dutrey, Alexander, trainee, at the Department for Development Policy at the Swedish Ministry of Foreign Affairs, interview, 080307

Tobisson, Eva, Senior Adviser at the Department for Development Policy at the Swedish Ministry of Foreign Affairs, interview, 080307
Appendix 1: Instrument guide for the analysis

- What are the objectives for policy coherence emphasized in the PGD?
  - “For what and for whom”?

- What are the objectives of PGD?

- What does PGD emphasize on the issue of migration?

- Are these objectives reflected in the proposal of Committee? How?

- What are the possible outcomes of the proposal and is this adequate according to the intentions of PGD?

- Does the proposal reinforce or conflict with the objectives of PGD?

- Does the proposal of the Committee provide possibilities for a win-win-win situation?
  - Do they consider the impact on the;

- Country of origin in the aspect of;
  - Overpopulation relief
  - Poverty relief
  - Benefits from return
  - Macro effects of remittances

- Individual success

- Country of destination
  - Benefits from such labour that is currently needed
  - Demographic needs
  - Ageing population

- Has the Committee committed a careful forecast about possible social effects to the country of origin?

- And, if so, have they let the results have any impact on their proposal?

- Is their argument relevant, consistent and sustainable?
Appendix 2: Interview guide

1. What is your strategy when you make an analysis with a PGD focus? What do you especially consider?

2. Do you find that The Committee on Labour Immigration take the objectives of PGD into consideration? If not what are your comments?

3. Labour immigration has the aim to support the receiving country in a positive way. How does that aim affect the sending countries?

4. The report on labour immigration presents the view that migration is positive for development. Remittances are one effect mentioned. What are your views on the importance of remittances?

5. Brain circulation is often mentioned as a positive outcome of migration. What do you think about the possibilities to reach brain circulation?

6. What would be needed to create a situation where the countries of origin are positively affected by migration?
### Appendix 3: UN chart; “Balance sheet” of economic effects of migration on countries of origin

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Positive effects</th>
<th>Negative effects</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Provides opportunities to workers not available in the home country</td>
<td>• Loss of highly skilled workers and reduced quality of essential services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• May ease the effect on the domestic market of the supply of excess labour.</td>
<td>• Reduced growth and productivity because of the lower stock of highly skilled workers and its externalities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Inflow of remittances and foreign exchange.</td>
<td>• Lower return from public investments in public education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Technology transfer, investments and venture capital contributed by diasporas.</td>
<td>• Selective migration may cause increasing disparities in incomes in the home country.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Can contribute to increased trade flows between sending and receiving countries.</td>
<td>• Loss of fiscal revenue from taxation of workers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Stimulus to investment in domestic education and individual human capital investments.</td>
<td>• Remittances may diminish over time.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Return of skilled workers may increase local human capital, transfer or skills and links to foreign networks.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

218 Sou 2006:87: p.262